



WALES AUDIT OFFICE  
SWYDDFA ARCHWILIO CYMRU

Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru  
Auditor General for Wales

# Overview and Scrutiny – Fit For the Future? – **The City of Cardiff Council**

Audit year: 2017-18

Date issued: September 2017

Document reference: 128A2017-18

DRAFT

This document has been prepared for the internal use of the City of Cardiff Council as part of work performed/to be performed in accordance with statutory functions.

No responsibility is taken by the Auditor General, the staff of the Wales Audit Office or, where applicable, the appointed auditor in relation to any member, director, officer or other employee in their individual capacity, or to any third party.

In the event of receiving a request for information to which this document may be relevant, attention is drawn to the Code of Practice issued under section 45 of the Freedom of Information Act 2000.

The section 45 Code sets out the practice in the handling of requests that is expected of public authorities, including consultation with relevant third parties. In relation to this document, the Auditor General for Wales, the Wales Audit Office and, where applicable, the appointed auditor are relevant third parties. Any enquiries regarding disclosure or re-use of this document should be sent to the Wales Audit Office at [info.officer@audit.wales](mailto:info.officer@audit.wales).

We welcome correspondence and telephone calls in Welsh and English. Corresponding in Welsh will not lead to delay. Rydym yn croesawu gohebiaeth a galwadau ffôn yn Gymraeg a Saesneg. Ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

Mae'r ddogfen hon hefyd ar gael yn Gymraeg. This document is also available in Welsh.

# Contents

## Project brief

Purpose and focus of the review	4
Intended benefits	4
Method	4
Main review questions	5
Timetable	5
Interview and observation list	6
Document request	7
Wales Audit Office contacts	7

## Appendices

Appendix 1 – recommendations from Good Scrutiny? Good Question? Scrutiny Improvement Study	8
Appendix 2 – outcomes and characteristics for effective local government overview and scrutiny	10

# Project brief

## Purpose and focus of the review

- 1 We will explore with councils how 'fit for the future' their scrutiny functions are. This will include considering how they are responding to current challenges, including the Well-being of Future Generations Act (WFG Act), in relation to their scrutiny activity, as well as how councils are beginning to undertake scrutiny of public service boards. We will examine how well placed councils are to respond to future challenges including continued pressure on public finances and the possible move towards more regional working between local authorities.
- 2 As part of this review we will also review the progress councils have made in addressing the recommendations of our earlier National Improvement Study **Good Scrutiny? Good Question**.<sup>1</sup> We will also follow up on any proposals for improvement relevant to scrutiny that we have issued in any subsequent local reports including those issued to councils as part of our 2016-17 thematic reviews of Savings Planning and Governance Arrangements for Determining Significant Service Changes.

## Intended benefits

- 3 The intended benefits of undertaking this project are:
  - identification of approaches to embedding the sustainable development principle into scrutiny processes and practices to inform practice sharing and future work of the Auditor General in relation to the WFG Act;
  - providing assurance that scrutiny functions are well placed to respond to current and future challenges and expectations;
  - helping to embed effective scrutiny by elected members from the start of this new electoral cycle; and
  - providing insight into how well councils have responded to the findings of our previous Scrutiny Improvement Study.

## Method

- 4 To inform our findings we will base our methodology around the Outcomes and Characteristics for Effective Local Government Overview and Scrutiny that were developed and agreed by scrutiny stakeholders in Wales following our previous Scrutiny Improvement Study.
- 5 We will initially undertake document reviews, interview a small number of key officers and run focus groups with key councillors to understand their views on the City of Cardiff Council's (the Council) current scrutiny arrangements and in

---

<sup>1</sup> **Good Scrutiny? Good Question! – Auditor General for Wales improvement study: Scrutiny in Local Government (May 2014)** available at [www.audit.wales](http://www.audit.wales)

particular how the Council intends to respond to the challenges identified above. We will also explore councils' approaches to PSB scrutiny as part of the interviews.

- 6 We will select scrutiny committee meetings to observe and review relevant documentation provided to members to support their scrutiny role, such as reports and presentations.
- 7 After we have reported our findings to each council we will consider how we can best work with other scrutiny stakeholders to share learning, for example through regional seminars.

## Main review questions

Exhibit 1: main review questions

Is the Council's overview and scrutiny function well placed to respond to current and future challenges?
<b>Level 2</b>
<b>Scrutiny environment</b> Is the Council creating a supportive <b>environment</b> to enable scrutiny to operate effectively?
<b>Scrutiny practice</b> Is the <b>operation</b> of the scrutiny function well planned, efficient, objective and based on evidence from a range of sources?
<b>Scrutiny impact</b> Is overview and scrutiny activity contributing to <b>improvements</b> in performance and decision making?

## Timetable

- 8 The table below sets out the proposed timeline for the review although timescales may vary depending on circumstances in individual councils. The specific timetable for undertaking the work will be discussed with our Council contacts as part of project set arrangements.

Exhibit 2: proposed timetable

Proposed timetable	
Project set-up meeting	September 2017
Fieldwork including meeting observations	October 2017–January 2018
Local report issued	March 2018
Regional seminars	April/May 2018 (exact date to be confirmed)

## Interview and observation list

Exhibit 3: who we would like to interview as part of the review

Name	Job Title
Paul Orders	Interview with Chief Executive
Davina Fiore	Monitoring Officer
TBD	Head of Democratic Services
Gill Nurton	Committee and Member Services Manager
Nicola Newton	Principal Scrutiny Officer
TBD	PSB Co-ordinator or equivalent
Cllr Bridgeman Cllr McGarry Cllr Howells Cllr Patel Cllr Walker	Focus group with chairs of scrutiny committees
Cllr Thomas Cllr Merry Cllr Hinchey Cllr Michael Cllr Bradbury Cllr Weaver Cllr Thorne Cllr Goodway Cllr Ellsmore Cllr Wild	Focus group with Cabinet
TBD	Focus group with scrutiny committee members newly elected as members of the Council in 2017
TBD	Focus group with scrutiny committee members who were also elected members of the Council prior to the 2017 elections
Observations of relevant overview and scrutiny meetings	Between two and four meetings

## Document request

Exhibit 4: documents we would like to request from the Council

Document title
Member induction programme and member attendance records
Scrutiny Support staff structure
Sample of reports or materials provided to members at informal 'scrutiny' meetings eg member seminars/workshops or task and finish groups (where applicable)
Minutes, reports and agendas of PSB Scrutiny Committee (or equivalent)
Council scrutiny improvement action plan (if applicable)
We will also access documents that councils have already shared with us in relation to the WFG Act including documents obtained as part of our 'Year One Commentary' work

## Wales Audit Office contacts

Exhibit 5: Wales Audit Office contacts

Name	Contact details
Performance Audit Director	Huw Rees <a href="mailto:Huw.Rees@audit.wales">Huw.Rees@audit.wales</a>
Performance Audit Manager	Non Jenkins <a href="mailto:Non.Jenkins@audit.wales">Non.Jenkins@audit.wales</a>
Performance Audit Manager	Sara-Jane Byrne <a href="mailto:Sara-Jane.Byrne@audit.wales">Sara-Jane.Byrne@audit.wales</a>
Performance Auditor	Allison Rees <a href="mailto:Allison.Rees@audit.wales">Allison.Rees@audit.wales</a>
Performance Auditor	Ian Phillips <a href="mailto:Ian.Phillips@audit.wales">Ian.Phillips@audit.wales</a>

# Appendix 1

## Recommendations from Good Scrutiny? Good Question? Scrutiny Improvement Study

Exhibit 6: recommendations from **Good Scrutiny? Good Question?** Scrutiny Improvement Study

Recommendation	Responsible Partners
R1 Clarify the role of executive members and senior officers in contributing to scrutiny.	Councils, Welsh Government, Welsh Local Government Association
R2 Ensure that scrutiny members, and specifically scrutiny chairs, receive training and support to fully equip them with the skills required to undertake effective scrutiny.	Councils, Welsh Government, Welsh Local Government Association
R3 Further develop scrutiny forward work programming to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• provide a clear rationale for topic selection;</li><li>• be more outcome focussed;</li><li>• ensure that the method of scrutiny is best suited to the topic area and the outcome desired; and</li><li>• align scrutiny programmes with the council's performance management, self-evaluation and improvement arrangements.</li></ul>	Councils
R4 Ensure that scrutiny draws effectively on the work of audit, inspection and regulation and that its activities are complementary with the work of external review bodies.	Councils, Staff of the Wales Audit Office, CSSIW, Estyn
R5 Ensure that external review bodies take account of scrutiny work programmes and the outputs of scrutiny activity, where appropriate, in planning and delivering their work.	Staff of the Wales Audit Office, CSSIW, Estyn

Recommendation	Responsible Partners
R6 Ensure that the impact of scrutiny is properly evaluated and acted upon to improve the function's effectiveness; including following up on proposed actions and examining outcomes.	Councils, Welsh Government, Welsh Local Government Association
R7 Undertake regular self-evaluation of scrutiny utilising the 'outcomes and characteristics of effective local government overview and scrutiny' developed by the Wales Overview & Scrutiny Officers' Network.	Council
R8 Implement scrutiny improvement action plans developed from the Wales Audit Office improvement study.	Councils
R9 Adopt Participation Cymru's 10 Principles for Public Engagement in improving the way scrutiny engages with the public and stakeholders.	Councils

# Appendix 2

## Outcomes and characteristics for effective local government overview and scrutiny

Exhibit 7: outcomes and characteristics for effective local government overview and scrutiny

Outcomes	Characteristics
<p><b>What does good scrutiny seek to achieve?</b></p>	<p><b>What would it look like? How could we recognise it?</b></p>
<p><b>1. Democratic accountability drives improvement in public services. 'Better Services'</b></p>	<p><b>Environment</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i) Scrutiny has a clearly defined and valued role in the council's improvement arrangements.</li> <li>ii) Scrutiny has the dedicated officer support it needs from officers who are able to undertake independent research effectively, and provide Scrutiny members with high-quality analysis, advice and training.</li> </ul> <p><b>Practice</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>iii) Overview and Scrutiny inquiries are non-political, methodologically sound and incorporate a wide range of evidence and perspectives.</li> </ul> <p><b>Impact</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>iv) Overview and scrutiny regularly engages in evidence based challenge of decision makers and service providers.</li> <li>v) Scrutiny provides viable and well evidenced solutions to recognised problems.</li> </ul>
<p><b>2. Democratic decision making is accountable, inclusive and robust. 'Better decisions'</b></p>	<p><b>Environment</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i) Scrutiny councillors have the training and development opportunities they need to undertake their role effectively.</li> <li>ii) The process receives effective support from the Council's Corporate Management Team which ensures that information provided to scrutiny is of high quality and is provided in a timely and consistent manner.</li> </ul> <p><b>Practice</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>iii) Scrutiny is Member led and has 'ownership' of its work programme taking into account the views of the public, partners and regulators whilst balancing between prioritising community concerns against issues of strategic risk and importance.</li> <li>iv) Stakeholders have the ability to contribute to the development and delivery of scrutiny forward work programmes.</li> <li>v) Overview and scrutiny meetings and activities are well-planned, chaired effectively and make best use of the resources available to it.</li> </ul> <p><b>Impact</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>vi) Non-executive Members provide an evidence based check and balance to Executive decision making.</li> <li>vii) Decision makers give public account for themselves at scrutiny committees for their portfolio responsibilities.</li> </ul>
<p><b>What does good scrutiny seek to achieve?</b></p>	<p><b>What would it look like? How could we recognise it?</b></p>

Outcomes	Characteristics
<p><b>3. The public is engaged in democratic debate about the current and future delivery of public services.</b></p>	<p><b>Environment</b></p> <p>i) Scrutiny is recognised by the Executive and Corporate Management team as an important council mechanism for community engagement.</p> <p><b>Practice</b></p> <p>ii) Scrutiny is characterised by effective communication to raise awareness of, and encourage participation in democratic accountability.</p> <p>iii) Scrutiny operates non-politically and deals effectively with sensitive political issues, tension and conflict.</p> <p>iv) Scrutiny builds trust and good relationships with a wide variety of internal and external stakeholders.</p> <p><b>Impact</b></p> <p>v) Overview and scrutiny enables the 'voice' of local people and communities across the area to be heard as part of decision and policy-making processes.</p>

Wales Audit Office  
24 Cathedral Road  
Cardiff CF11 9LJ

Tel: 029 2032 0500

Fax: 029 2032 0600

Textphone: 029 2032 0660

E-mail: [info@audit.wales](mailto:info@audit.wales)

Website: [www.audit.wales](http://www.audit.wales)

Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru  
24 Heol y Gadeirlan  
Caerdydd CF11 9LJ

Ffôn: 029 2032 0500

Ffacs: 029 2032 0600

Ffôn testun: 029 2032 0660

E-bost: [post@archwilio.cymru](mailto:post@archwilio.cymru)

Gwefan: [www.archwilio.cymru](http://www.archwilio.cymru)